

# Appointments Review Group ARG

*overview for ECSA  
October 1, 2008*

*\*A new document summarizing the ARG process will appear on the ARG website in fall 2008.*

# ARG members

- Voting:
  - ~20 Senior Scientists, selected by NCAR Director ensuring appropriate representation of labs, divisions, and institutes.
  - 3-year terms
  - Chair selected by vote, usually in 3<sup>rd</sup> year.
- Non-voting (but participate in discussions):
  - NCAR Director
  - NCAR Deputy Director
  - UCAR Director of Human Resources and Employee Relations or delegate
  - NCAR Lab Directors
  - NCAR Division Directors
  - Manager, Directorate Operations

# Schedule Overview – part 1

- SUMMER, FALL:
  - NCAR Divisions and labs review ladder track scientists
  - On request of the Early Career Scientists Assembly, the ARG Chair will give an overview of the ARG process to early career scientists
- DECEMBER
  - Call for ARG Nominations memo from NCAR Director
  - In response to request from ARG Administrator, Lab Directors estimate number of nominees.
- JANUARY *due 9 January in 2009*
  - Lab Directors submit nominations via ARG Tool Database
- First ARG meeting *22-23 January in 2009*
  - Collect questions for further investigation
  - Establish investigative subcommittees
  - Finalize list of referees *requests mailed 1 February in 2009*

# Schedule Overview – part 2

- FEBRUARY
  - Initial meetings of Investigative Subcommittees
- MARCH
  - Candidate seminars
  - Follow-up meetings of Investigative Subcommittees
  - Reference letters due *31 March in 2009*
- APRIL/MAY
  - Mid-April: Investigative Subcommittee reports due *15 April in 2009*
  - April/May: Second ARG meeting *30 April – 1 May in 2009*
  - May: Level III appointments by Director of NCAR
  - May: Board of Trustees review of Senior nominations *~14 May in 2009*
- JUNE
  - June: Senior appointments appointed by Director of NCAR

# Nomination Materials

- Cover Memo
- Candidate Bio
- Curriculum Vitae
- Publication List
- Narrative
- Statement of Expectations
- 2 Selected Publications and a Brief Overview Statement about each
- Position Description
- List of Potential Referees

# CRITERIA

- **Scientific Excellence** - *quality and impact of work*
  - Productivity
  - Leadership
  - National and International Reputation
  - Contributions to NCAR Programs
  - Breadth
  - Scientific and Technical Service in the NCAR Context
  - Broad Community Service
  - Awards

# **ARG Committee 1st Meeting: preliminary review**

- **Presentation of the Nomination(s)**  
The nominating Lab Director or delegate presents the nomination.
- **Discussion of the Nomination Case and Identification of Issues**  
ARG Members discuss the nomination and identify issues for Investigative Subcommittee to consider.
- **Selection of Referees (external letters)**
- **Selecting the Membership of Investigative Subcommittees**
  - One Investigative Subcommittee for each nomination
  - Membership chosen by ARG
  - 3 members, all NCAR Senior Scientists; at least one must be a current ARG member
  - No member from the nominating entity

# Investigative Subcommittee

- Members must be NCAR Senior Scientists.
- Investigate in detail the qualifications and work of the candidate.
- Specific activities may include:
  - Reading the nomination materials
  - Reading and discussing the nominee's scientific publications
  - Speaking with colleagues at NCAR
  - Reviewing the citation report on the nominee's publications
  - Interviewing the nominee
  - Attending seminars given by the nominee
  - Carefully considering the opinions of the external referees
  - Investigating any significant gaps in documentation with the nominator
  - Investigating particular issues raised by the ARG

*Report is factual, NOT a recommendation*

# Letters from Referees

- **All are external to NCAR**
- **Letters and names of letter-writers are confidential.**
- **Level III nominations:** total of 8 are requested.
- The nominating entity selects 3 and proposes 5 additional names for the ARG to consider.
- The ARG may add names to the proposed referee list, and will choose the final 5 referees, for a total of 8.
- In the final list, at least 3 of the referees must be international.
- **Senior appointment nominations:** total of 10 are requested.
- The nominating entity selects 4 and proposes 6 additional names for the ARG to consider.
- The ARG may add names to the proposed referee list, and will chose the final 6 referees, for a total of 10.
- In the final list, at least 5 of the referees must be international.

# Seminar given by the nominee

- 1 hour = 45-50 min + 10-15 min for questions
- Should be well prepared: clear organization, crisp slides, interesting
- Audience: NCAR scientists including those outside candidate's specialty.
- Cover specific scientific topic, e.g. recent research, not a list of lifetime activities
- Don't think of it as "ARG seminar" but rather as a really good Department Seminar.

# ARG Committee 2nd Meeting: final review

## **Presentation of the Investigative Subcommittee Reports**

- Chair gives a brief summary of the report.
- ARG Members may ask for specific clarification or amplification of points in the report.
- After this discussion, any non-ARG members of the subcommittee are excused.

## **General Discussion**

- Members discuss the merits of the nomination, considering all materials presented or in the file.

## **Balloting**

- ARG votes on each nomination by secret ballot.
- No abstentions are allowed.
- ARG members are encouraged to write the reasons for their recommendation on the ballot. In the case of a negative vote, written comments are mandatory. The comments are transcribed and given to the NCAR Director. These comments may be communicated to the candidate at the discretion of the NCAR Director.

## **Ballot Count**

- The Human Resource Director and the ARG Administrator count the ballots and provide the results to the ARG Chair.
- Favorable votes by two-thirds of voting members present are required to support a recommendation for appointment.
- The ARG conveys these results as a recommendation to the NCAR Director.

# Notification of Results

- Level III Appointments: After review of the recommendations of the ARG, the NCAR Director shall make offers by letter to the successful Level III Candidates within one month of the second ARG meeting.
- Senior Appointments: After review of the recommendations of the ARG, the NCAR Director shall make a preliminary decision on the promotion of senior level candidates. After presenting the preliminary list to the UCAR Board of Trustees for review and authorization, the NCAR Director then makes offers by letter to the successful senior level candidates within one month of the Board of Trustees meeting.
- All promotions are effective July 1.

# ARG URLs

NCAR Scientific Appointments Criteria:

<http://www.ncar.ucar.edu/central/arg/overview/criteria.php>

Nominations Packet Components:

<http://www.ncar.ucar.edu/central/arg/nominations/guidelines.php>

ARG Membership Roster 2008:

<http://www.ncar.ucar.edu/central/arg/members/members.php>